
LOCATING THE OTHER: A GEOCRITICAL DELIBERATION ON TOLKIEN'S MIDDLE-EARTH

Eesha Sajid

M.Phil. in English Literature from GCWUS

Email: eesha_123sajid@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

This study highlights a salient feature of the setting in J. R. R. Tolkien's legendarium, the secondary world of Middle-earth: its colonial set-up - a fact, the reader is as much conscious of as the characters are ignorant. Location of Self and Other in the races of Middle-earth, identification of the chief tropes of Self and Other of primary world in those belonging to Middle-earth, and tracing the existence of Othering in the fabric of this initiator of Epic Fantasy are the purposes of this study. This paper has used Geocriticism and its tenet of spatiality as the tool for textual analysis of Middle-earth, as shown and explained chiefly in *Lord of the Rings*. Events and narratives of *The Hobbit* and *The Silmarillion* have also been taken into consideration.

This paper brings to light, establishment of Men of West as the Self of Middle-earth by the author, while races of Elves, Hobbits and Orcs serve as the Othered reciprocal to the colonial reality of their world. Several aspects, including comparative geographical and topographical settings, physical and mental delineation of characters belonging to different races, as well as the turns of the plot itself in these works have analyzed in this study. Findings of this paper reveal a perpetuation of colonial and imperialist thought- through the presence and formation of Middle-earth, along with justifications of righteousness of this set up- by the contentment of the characters at their predicament.

Introduction:

The Geographically strategic presence of Men of West (Gondor and Rohan) Hobbits, Elves and Orcs establishes them as the Self, Exotic and Demonic Other of the 'Middle-earth'. And this presence of Self and Other evokes a racial, spatial

and political warfare in the first conceived realm of English Epic Fantasy. Although Postcolonial stance has often been used for the analysis of Tolkien's works, yet concepts of exoticism and demonification that have pervaded into the text and remain unanalyzed by previous scholarship provides the gap that allows this study to be conducted. The all-privileged and righteous Self and the resultant Othering of other races remain the primary concern of this paper. There are two things that ought to be cleared in the very beginning: whenever the term 'Men' (standing for the race and not the gender) is used in this research, it refers to the Men of Rohan and Gondor (Men of the West). Secondly, although 'Middle-earth' is a continent in the world of 'Arda', however, keeping up with the tradition of Tolkien Scholars and the author himself, and owing to the fact that there are no other continents in the said world, the term 'Middle-earth' refers to the entire Secondary world occupied by the characters of the saga.

Not only has the study been conducted by locating colonial markers in the text, but those findings have been validated through tangible tenets of Geocriticism which has been used as a tool for the said analysis. To find out the Self, Exotic Other and Demonic Other of Middle-earth, chief traits of the Self and Other in the primary world have also been compared with and identified in the races of Middle-earth apart from an inquiry into their geographical and topological development of the Secondary World. For Robert Tally, Literary Cartography and Literary Geography, former, being the writer's attempt at creating spaces and the latter: a reader's perception of those spaces "[together] continue to uncover or invent new means of making sense of the ways we make sense of the world" (Tally, 2013, p. 56). This cartographic or

spatial approach provides us with two different concepts; one is 'space' and the other is 'geo-space' or 'place' - the real world referent.

The perception of a place, be it concrete or abstract, is called a space. Geocriticism, then, may be defined as a cartographical investigation of places and their reciprocal spaces in literature. Robert Tally (2011) in his introduction the book *Geocritical Explorations*, defines Geocriticism as a framework that focuses on the spatial representations within [literary] texts" while also "explor[ing] the overlapping territories of actual, physical geography and an author's or character's cognitive mapping in the literary text." (p. 54). This concept of Geocritique; along with its tents of multifocalisation, polysensoriality, stratigraphic vision and intertextuality, bears a close resemblance to the concepts of Orientalism, Self and Other and has therefore been used a tool in the grander narrative of Postcolonialism for analysis of the text.

Conceived, Perceived and Lived Spaces:

Another important concept in the evolution of Spatiality is of Henri Lefebvre's 'Conceived, Perceived and Lived Spaces'. In his book 'The Production of Space' Lefebvre argues that spaces have three categories or modalities of representation.

" Perceived space corresponds to a concrete practice of space. More interesting for us, conceived space is itself a representation of space: it is the space of urban planners, mapmakers, and others. As for lived space, it is constituted by the spaces of representation, which is to say, lived spaces are experienced through images and symbols" (Lefebvre, 1991, p.85).

From this elaboration, it can be understood that perceived space is the actual place while conceived space is the space the writer has formed from that place. Literary cartography incorporates that conceived space in its structure. Meanwhile, the

reader's perception of the space is the lived space. However, as we have already established that intertextuality plays a key role in the formation of reality, we may state that reader's perceived space might have been the writer's lived space in the first place; rendering the cycle a closed, self-generating circle of multifocal realities. Both Geocriticism and Orientalism are structured upon the cycle of perceived, additive and conceived realities. Orientalism, according to Edward Said is essentially "geographical inquiry into historical experiences. (Said, 2012, p.7) Robert Tally in 'The Geocritical legacies of Edward Said' calls Said's work in Postcolonial theory to be the foundation for geocritical or spatial literary theory (Tally, 2015, p. 4) for the underlying principles of Geocriticism and that of Post Colonial Theory are similar to such an extent that we can call Orient to be a Place while Orientalism is the Space. Unlike fiction, set in the primary world, fantasy is a genre operating solely on secondary worlds. In Geocritical terms "the Tale is the Map which is the Territory" (Gaiman, 2006, pp. xix-xx). It can, therefore, be argued that Fantasy in itself is a chief example of Spatiality with a very strong potential to formulate and play with the concepts of: Orientalism in secondary worlds, and Self and Other as can be seen in the very fabric of *The Lord of the Rings*.

Literature Review:

Among multiple aspects of critiques addressed to LOTR, the chief group remains those of Racial allegations in the threads of its fabrication. Several studies that have been conducted with this stance acted as the pivoting thoughts which lead to the idea investigated in this study. Anderson Rearic, wrote an article "Why is the Only Good Orc a Dead Orc? The Dark Face of Racism Examined in Tolkien's World" hence initiating a pivotal debate on colonial traits in contemporary Epic Fantasy. Elizabeth Messa Hoiem in her article provides a different angle to the Colonial rearity of Tolkien's legendarium. Focusing on Imperialism in LOTR through Aldarion and Earendil, Holem asserts that Aldarion essentially started the tumble through his

voyages into ‘unknown spaces’ which eventually led to Numenorean downfall. (Hoiem, 2005, p. 77). The graduation dissertation “The Uncanny and the Postcolonial in J.R.R. Tolkien’s Middle-Earth” by Molly Brown-Fuller also establishes that LOTR, in its themes and characterization, is a potentially colonial text, positing that not only is the colonialist mind set limited to this story, but this could mean that similar markers exist in the works by other writers as well. (Brown-Fuller, 2013)

As geocriticism is a relatively recent approach, not much work has been done utilizing this framework as a key tool for in-depth analysis of secondary world of Middle-earth. Sanni Hakkarainen in her dissertation “The Land of Shadow Reading Mordor in J. R. R. Tolkien’s *Lord of the Rings*: A Geopolitical Threat or the Suppressed Other?” submitted to University of Tampere, established a link between cartography and LOTR. Hakkarainen uses the concepts of both Tally and Westphal in comprehension of the Middle-earth through a geocritical lens. Her study, however, remains limited to the Otherness of Mordor. Comparing the East and the West in Tolkien’s world, a comparison of light and Dark itself, the work proposes that Mordor is the land of ‘Shadow’, hence unmapped. Although, here it is Sauron’s decision to keep it so, yet the unmapped terrain can easily be associated to once dark land of Africa in European eyes. This all enveloping darkness is not only because of the geographical setting comprising of threatening dark mountains, but it is the Other darkness that cannot be completely understood by foreign races. The famous poem ‘One ring to rule them all’ provides ample evidence that true shadows are indeed spread only on the lands of Mordor. (Hakkarainen, 2013, p.79)

According to Hakkarainen the cultural differences in the African landscape was feared out of a lack of knowledge regarding the land and similar beliefs can be witnessed in Middle-earth as well. Mordor has no maps. Its geography remains uncharted and hence Sam and Frodo, our Hobbits, must brave the dangers of this land sans any guidance or

written maps. This spatial anxiety or concept of ‘unhomeliness’, being felt by the Hobbits, is a primary tenet of spatial theory. Sense of displacement or uncertainty corresponds to both literal and figurative state of being lost, and the Hobbits appear to be in the throes of both. (Hakkarainen 2013, p. 3; Tally, 2013, p. 47)

Robert Tally’s essay ‘Tolkien’s Geopolitical Fantasy: Spatial Narrative in *The Lord of the Rings*’ curated by Lisa Fletcher in “Popular Fiction and Spatiality: Reading Genre Settings” claims that Middle-earth serves as representative space of our own world. He takes the link between fantasy and primary world a step ahead by positing racism and othering an extension of primary world that invaded the fabric of secondary realities. (Tally, 2016) Hakkarainen goes as far as maintaining that it is essentially the literary cartography which serves as the basic goal of the narrative. (Hakkarainen, 2013, p.125) *Lord of the Rings*, in a nutshell, is a means to understand the broken, quite unexplainable world system of our primary world, as seen in the beginning till the mid of twentieth century. (p. 128) This not only makes Middle-earth a space of the primary world we inhabit but enables it to as an additive critic which deciphers the complexities of our world and also adds to its reality.

The Hole in the ground

Middle-earth is a vast region, and so provides a space, fertile for a vast array of approaches to be utilized for its analysis as befits a complex world structure. Much has been written and debated over in regard to this secondary world. Nevertheless, as this review suggests, although Racism has been studied with respect to Orcs and additionally at times Men of Middle-earth; Elves and Hobbits remain untouched by the curiosities of the critical voyagers. This paper, therefore, is a foray into Middle-earth’s narrative and descriptive structure in order to decipher the identities of Hobbits, Elves, Men and Orcs against the backdrop of Post-Colonial theory.

Presence of Self in Middle-earth

A very prominent hint towards the finding Self in 'Men' of West in Middle-earth has been given by Tolkien himself in his placement of Gondor towards the West of the World. King of Men, eventually becoming a King of all the peoples has an imperialist ring to it. Hobbits and Elves calling him Dunadan provides exogenous multifocalization, (multiple perspectives on a phenomenon as seen by non-natives) which is a vital support lent to the claim of spatializing of Men as Self of the world.

One of the earliest observations which one makes about the geography of Lord of the Rings is that the distinction among directions is not only geographical but ethical and moral as well. Time and again, West has been shown as 'light' or 'good' while east serves as the 'dark' and 'evil' counterpart. Characteristically urban, developed and well structured, they can be surmised as the lands of the occident. Analogy of 'light' versus 'dark' in description of lands of Men and Orcs and 'built' in contrast to 'rural' and 'magical' habitats of Hobbits and Elves highlights them primarily as the superior race and later on colonizer of Middle-earth. In her doctoral thesis, "Reimagining Tolkien: A Postcolonial Perspective on *The Lord of the Rings*" submitted to the University of Limerick, Louise Liebherr states that, "it would appear that this East/West binary is ultimately a socially constructed divide which is based upon a Good/Evil, us/them distinction". (Liebherr, 2012, p.117) This term of 'socially constructed' divide reflects Said's views on Orient being a socially constructed belief. Pippin's description of Gondor in the Return of the King resonates with Liebherr's analysis when he states that East is covered in shadows while Western geography is characterized by rising, proud mountain peaks and the rives appears to have divided the land for a battlefield. (Tolkien, 2007, p. 982)

Gondor and Rohan serve as the two strong holds of 'Men' of Middle-earth. Situated side by side, Gondor is situated squarely in the West while

Rohan is towards North as shown in the maps. What sets them apart from the rest of the lands is their political and structural setup. They are both 'Kingdoms'- a term which has not been designated to any other region in this world. This very distinction serves as an important justification for calling the spatial projection of all other regions or 'places', highly transgressive in nature. Not only does this lowers their vitality or sanctity as a stronghold in contrast to Gondor and Rohan but may be seen as an attempt at dubbing them, open to be ruled by other countries, namely Rohan and Gondor. Apart from this ideological dissimilarity, the geographical built also sets these regions apart from each other. Rohan and Gondor happen to have urban set-up. Their population hubs are proper cities. Their description is usually given through eyes of non-natives for complete effect. Elven ayes of Legolas describe Edoras as "A dike and mighty wall and thorny fence encircle it. Within there rise the roofs of houses; and in the midst, set upon a green terrace, there stands aloft a great hall of Men". (Tolkien, 2001, p. 175) Similarly, Gondor is grander in strength and development, a civilized nation now in trouble after long wars with Eastern Orcs. There are streets and highways and proper departments for governance of the city. City structure is divided into multiple rings and blocks, much like the structure of Modern European cities. The hint of underlying urbanity in both capitals, Edoras as well as Minas Tirith is an entirely foreign concept to the shire-brought up Pippin or cave-dweller Gimli.

Helen Young, in her book *Race and Popular Fantasy Literature*, writes that Riders of Rohan clearly depict the "influence of philological Anglo-Saxonism" since they "resemble the ancient English down to minute detail". (Young, 2016, p. 22)

In *The Two Towers*, one of the Orcs calls the 'race' of Men, 'white' of skin. "You're cooked. The Whiteskins will catch you and eat you. They're coming!" (Tolkien, 2001, p. 57) Whiteness as a trait of Self or colonizer in the Primary world, and Men being a projection of Western races, hints at Men

being the Self of Secondary world of Middle-earth. They are proud, a characteristic very much evident from the very introduction of Lord Denethor, Gondor's steward who wouldn't become a tool for anyone else no matter "however worthy" (Tolkien, 27, p. 992). His denial of any other power capable of controlling his free self, whether righteous or not, provides a glimpse into the hearts of the people of these regions who prefer their own counsel and control over themselves, unlike the peoples of the rest of the world who have not been provided with this choice of independence. Another trait which sets them apart from the Exotic Other is the delineation of women in the race Men. Unlike Galadriel, the figure head of Lothlorien and a ring bearer, and unlike Arwen, beautiful in cadence and independent of the Men of her family; both whose characters depict the archetypal women of Exotic Others, the women of Self are brave but dependent on the men surrounding them, more powerful and austere than those of Exotic races. King of Rohan, ordering his niece Eowen, despite her being a spirited woman, to stay behind in Helm's Deep, rule in his stead but not in her own fortifies this argument.

Lord of the Rings essentially revolves around the fight of Aragorn, claiming his throne after passing through many perils and hardships and rising to assume the control of a better part of Middle-earth and breaking of the powers of Rings. Rings, were a source to control their bearers made by the Evil Lord himself. They may also be taken as a symbol of East's power over West dubbed Evil after an attempt to seize control from others. Not only do the Men call it evil, but all other races as well. Winning against that dark reign and reclaiming the throne of the White city by the race of Numenor (Aragorn's ancestral race among the lineages of Men) serves as the prime purpose of the story told. Werber in his article Geo- and Biopolitics of Middle-Earth: A German Reading of Tolkien's 'The Lord of the Rings' claims the series to be a "Western allegory of the danger from the East" (Werber, 2005, p. 237)

Treatment of Self with Others can be divided into two very discrete categories. Where the foundations of Self's relations with the Exotic are built on orientalizing of the exotic regions, treatment with the Demonic Other requires no such pretence and is often outright and overtly condemning. The same principles can be observed in the behavior of Men with Hobbits, Elves and Orcs. Where Hobbits and Elves are both pure and innocent which stimulate curiosity, Orcs are easily creatures of Evil and darkness that require no negotiation on the issue of their existence. There is a belief among the Men of West that they possess a "strand of 'blood' and inheritance, derived from the Elves, and that the art and poetry of Men is largely dependent on it, or modified by it." (Tolkien, 2013, p. xx) Although studying their lore has kept Men of West busy for years yet they appear not so brave in the eyes of Boromir, providing an endogenous perspective on the perceived and conceived reality of Elves, whom he supposes are not wise but cowardly to hide behind their lores and books. (Tolkien, 1991, p. 517) Treatment of Exotic Women is another feature in colonial realities. Arwen being the willful partner for Aragorn, despite her immortality, is a textbook description of Self's behavior with the Exotic Other.

Hobbits, contrary to Elves, remain hidden from the eyes of Men and have turned into mere legends. Relegating their existence to legends, written and spoken by and written and spoken for Men again hints into the Self identity of Men of West. They are not considered real by the Rohirrim in the second installment of the series, and believed to be a part of myths and tales. "Do we walk in legends or on the green earth in the daylight?" asked Eomer of Rohan on being enquired about Merry and Pippin's whereabouts. This lack of knowledge about Hobbits and a belief of their entire race being a part of magical tales is a strong clue towards their exotification in the eyes of Self as a rule. (Tolkien, 2001, p. 33). Their treatment with Orcs is entirely different than their treatment with the exotic races of the Middle-earth. A quality of Men of Rohan is that they are not sympathetic to Orcs. They pride

themselves in not befriending the foul creatures of Middle-earth. (Tolkien, 2001, p.28) Seen as a mark of evil, roaming free in the Eastern lands, Self wishes to stow the Orcs' "darkness" and "bad air" far away, with their swords made of shining white metals. (p. 28)

'Out of the Great; Sea to Middle-earth I am come. In this place will I abide, and; my heirs, unto the ending of the world.' (Tolkien, 2007, p. 1268) These words were first spoken by Elendil on his ascension to the throne and later on by Aragorn during his own. The term 'Middle-earth' being used in this scenario instead of the names of their own regions shows the imperial intentions and beliefs readily ingrained in Western rulers of Middle-earth. However, them not even acknowledging the presence of other races, hints at not only imperial but predominantly 'Self' traits as well. Immediately after his ascending, what follows is the distribution of lands among lords of West. Ithilien is given to Faramir while Minas Ithil is to be destroyed to erase any signs of the foul times of Orc occupation of the city. (Tolkien, 2007, p.1270) Minas Ithil being discussed here was formerly an Orc stronghold. No Orc appears to have been given the chance to pay fealty or bend the knee to the new emperor. Demarcating their status to animalistic faction of population by not only never including them in any discussion regarding their lands or in any discussion whatsoever, West comes forward as the dominant Self in the region.

Gandalf, in his speech at the coronation of Aragorn, all but declares the world his dominion. The fourth age, bringing an end to many things and yet preserving "what may be preserved" has a decidedly ambiguous ring to it. It leads to the question of what actually merited preservation in their eyes, when the Other races were being removed from the face of the Middle-earth in the narrative. Gandalf further goes on to say that "much has been saved", making once again a problematic statement when it is known to everyone including the readers and the characters that this 'saving' was Self saving exotic Others from themselves by

incorporating their domains in the empire. (Tolkien, 2007, p.1227) And while Exotics have been immersed in the colonial regime, Demons are either entirely killed or remained hunted throughout their existence. This statement, by normalizing the colonial reality for the characters, through both exogenous (Gandalf) and endogenous (Aragorn) focalization; creates and projects a colonial space of the world in the minds of the readers themselves. The Fourth age of Middle-earth began with the people of West as the sole rulers, having cut-off and disregarded the other races entirely, as the predominant and vital Self of the world.

Locating Other in the fabric of Middle-earth

Exotic Other:

The races of Hobbits, Elves and Orcs are among the chief races of Middle-earth around whom the story revolves. However, in the light of Postcolonialism, it can be stated, that in the treatment of the author as well as that of the Self with these races, exist clear traces of racial Othering; identifiable in the descriptions of characters belonging to these races and literary cartography of their lands. And where Hobbits and Elves may be characterized as the Exotic Others of Middle-earth, Orcs serve as the Demonic Other of the Secondary world.

The lands of Shire or Hobbiton and Rivendell can be located in north-western parts of Middle-earth while Lothlorien, the second chief abode of Elves is located near the south-western forests of the secondary world. Seemingly accessible from their geographical placement, all three locations remain far-off and hard to reach, from the narrative and characters' description of these locations. Despite the do-able traverse, the homes of Elves and Hobbits remain secluded and culturally detached from the rest of the World and can be seen as an example of Othering not always being dependent on directions but transgressivity in the spatialization of places.

In contrast to Self, the lands and holdings of both: the elves and hobbits, display an inherent rurality in their composition. Shire, or Hobbiton, serving as the home to Hobbits of Middle-earth, is rarely seen by any other race than those who are its natives. The Shire is introduced to the reader as a secluded land dotted with fields, rivers and woods accentuating its rural allure. (Tolkien, 1991, p. 55), it can be seen as a land formed of small hills, lush greenery, soft sunshine and abundant water resources. Its softness becomes more prominent in comparison with the well structured Minas Tirith (Gondor) and harsh rocky marshes of Cirith Ungol (Mordor). In Shire, Frodo's "bed was of fern and grass, deep and soft and strangely fragrant" while sunshine streaked through the lazily waving leaves of the early morning. (Tolkien, 1991, p. 122) This image can be seen and felt and smelled as well. This poly-sensorial account of a location aids in establishing Shire, decidedly lacking modernity in its essence. Elvish lands of Rivendell and Lothlorien also share this trait with Hobbiton. Elvish locations, as a matter of fact, can be seen to be even more primitive and at a distance with others than those of Hobbits.

Rivendell or Imladris, the land of Elrond, is described as a place untouched by the sorrows or troubles of the world. Frodo's belief of summers being elongated in this region and darkness, a part of the outside world alone secludes Rivendell in a bubble of other worldliness evident only Elven realms and houses. (Tolkien, 1991, p. 314) An exotic set-up and living style can be traced in these poly-sensorial images of Mirkwood, Rivendell and Hobbiton.

Besides Rivendell, the chief chief dwelling of Elves shown in LOTR is Lothlorien or the Golden Woods. It's first description is provided by Legolas, an Elf of Woodland realms (not to be mixed with the Gold Woods) as fairest of all Elvendwellings. . Making it more exotic are the golden floor and sky accentuated with pillars of silver (tree bark is silver in color). (Tolkien, 1991, p. 434) Not only is the second primary abode Elves an outright woodland instead of actual an city but those woods

in themselves are more different and are magical than the rest of the world's.

"And I listen and I think. Time doesn't seem to pass here: it just is. A remarkable place altogether." (Tolkien, 1991, p. 303). Rivendell is a place away from the constructs of time. While it passes in the rest of the world, but timelessness is a trait associated with the Exotic Others and can be seen in the lands of both Elves and the Hobbits. Not only does Rivendell not comply with the spacio-temporal pact of reality but the Lothlorien has also been spatialized as a timeless forest that appears as a time-jump to the Elder days, to the observer. Its timelessness is highlighted in FOTR where walking to these woods is described as "walking in a world that was no more" for in Lothlorien, those things still dwelled that were considered ancient in the eyes of the rest of the world. (Tolkien, 1991, p. 453)

Hobbits are a race dwindling in numbers by the end of the Third Age, who have a concern for their affairs only. Their simplistic way of life, an utter lack of influence of other races, love for their own lands only, and somewhat lower than human intelligence, marks them different than the Western Men, Elves or Orcs and a source of interest for the Self of *Middle-earth*. Elves, the second exotic Other of their reality, are a tall, beautiful and ageless race. Wisdom and Agelessness have been made their fundamental traits in the books. A description of Elrond, the lord of Rivendell can be seen as an archetypal description of Elves. His face is shown to be devoid of any signs of passing age. He can neither be called young, nor old, for what his unmarred skin hides is depicted in the wisdom of his eyes. "Venerable he seemed as a king crowned with many winters, and yet hale as a tried warrior in the fulness of his strength." (Tolkien, 1991, p. 297) Simultaneously old and young, Elrond wears mystery and other-wordly charm as easily as his silver circlet, leading to detection of traces of exoticism in the race of Elves.

Traces of Othering in the races of Elves and Hobbits are not only descriptive but narrative as well. The story of the legendarium also portrays

these races as the Other of the global political scenario. The story begins with a Hobbit sitting in a Hole, away from the worries of the world, in his secluded land. Both Bilbo and Frodo eventually become the center of the plot and perform feats of bravery and bring resolution to the conflict and yet the stories were never about those two characters. They are the outsiders who provide a fresh take on the situation. Placing Hobbits in the center narrative and making them a witness of all that happens in the narrative of these books is convenient for the colonialists' cause, since their untrained, trusting and innocent eyes provide just what is required for tilting the balance in favor of great Men, in the political interplay between Self and Elves also appear to be the Ring bearers, however their rings cannot be tainted with the evilness of East and remain magical in their own right. Treatment of Elves in the story is more orientalist than with the Hobbits. Elves appear to be first rulers of Middle-earth. Their power however lessened with the establishment of the Kingdoms of Men. By the Third Age, Elves have no kingdoms, except in Woodland Realms, and even their king never makes an appearance in the trilogy and appears to have left for Valinor by the end. Men are the sole proprietors of crowns and countries while Elves have been demarcated to secluded, tethered, mysterious lands no one seems to enter. The underlying traces of hybridity, in the aftermath of colonialism in the formation of Middle-earth, hint at the secondary world being a spatialization of the post-colonial reality of the Primary world. Their entire race vanishing by the Fourth Age and giving its place to the Self can be interpreted as an overt symbol of shifting of Power in the Secondary World of Tolkien.

Demonic Others of Middle-earth:

The race of Middle-earth which resonates with this kind of Othering is the race of Orcs. Brutal, demonic and animalistic by nature, they have been shown as the evil in the world of Middle-earth. Not only their description, but the terms in which they have been referred to makes them the Demonic Other in the minds of the characters as

well as the readers. Apart from the treatment of the Self with Orcs, an utter lack of knowledge of their societal or racial development in the narrative also serves as a primary reason for dubbing them as the Demonic Other of Middle-earth. Orcs have been placed squarely in the East of Middle-earth. Directions in the construction of orient may be an arbitrary concept, however, treatment of East in the moral geography of Middle-earth is direct and overt. Whenever various regions of Middle-earth are explained, or referred to, it is done more or less along the lines of "pretty Shire, proud Gondor, beautiful Imladris, terrible Mordor" (Werber, 2005, p. 227)

As the company moves towards the Brown lands away from the magical realm of Lothlorien, geography begins to change steadily at every step. Eastern bank supports only dull and brown plant life, appearing razed and singed from fire. Broken tree stumps, waste heaps and unfriendly sights welcome the company as soon as they start moving towards the desolate and dark Eryn Muiil hills. (Tolkien, 1991, p. 494) The only life that exists in these lands is evil and foul much like the Orcs themselves. The imagery can not only be seen but the darkness and foulness of the environment can easily be felt and smelled through the narrative. The alien flowers growing in this side of the world are described as luminous, "beautiful and yet horrible of shape" that released a sickening scent. A smell of rotteness laid over everything. The bridges over the marshes that Frodo and Sam were passing through were adorned with human and bestial forms. And the water moving beneath them was toxic enough to emit vapors. "Frodo felt his senses reeling and his mind darkening." (Tolkien, 2001, p. 389)

In her book, 'Race and Popular Fantasy Literature' Helen Young refers to Dieter Petzold's remarks that "for those who accuse Tolkien of racism, the orcs are key witnesses." (Young, 2016, p. 25) One of the earliest physical descriptions of Orcs in Lord of the Rings is in FOTR during their venture through Moria, where an Orc chieftain, giant in size and stature, wearing blackest mail,

corners the company. He is described to have a broad face and face “his eyes were like coals, and his tongue was red” (Tolkien, 1991, p. 422-23) Coal eyes and red tongue on crooked legged creatures, having a disproportionate body with arms long enough to reach the ground, Orcs clearly present a picture of a cross between an animal and a demon. (Tolkien, 2001, p. 50) This almost hatred with the race becomes even more visible in *Silmarillion*, where they are describes as “the vilest deed of Melkor, and the most hateful to Iluvatar”(Tolkien, 2013, p. 47) Animal imagery has been associated with them throughout the books. “Orcs were as keen as hounds on a scent, it was said, but they could also climb.” (Tolkien, 1991, p.447) Not only do they have the proverbial of keenness of hounds, but their climbing of trees depicts the true nature of analogy. By the end of the war, when Mordor has completely lost, Orcs have been shown as ants, mindlessly moving through the plains, fleeing their deaths. Some are even shown to have killed themselves or jumped into the fire pits or “fled wailing back to hide in holes and dark lightless places far from hope” (Tolkien, 2007, p.1243) This situation turns extremely problematic because committing suicide and fleeing the Self cannot be an act of mindless creatures. Their actions in this scenario, coupled with the beliefs of Self about them turn their race into the hunted, and slandered race of Demonic Other of Middle-earth.

Conclusion

Demarcations have existed along the mental and physical planes of the world as a result of artificially created beliefs of racial stereotypes. A careful crafting of the archetypal images of the peoples of the world through callous descriptions of biased observations; and then revitalization of those images through literature is the crux and bane of Post-colonial reality. This study has attempted at making a case for the argument that not only has the literature set in primary world been a channel to this phenomenon but the sub-created Secondary worlds share identical patterns in their structures.

The identification of the ‘far-off’ races of Hobbits, Elves and Orcs as Exotic and Demonic Other of the Middle-earth through a Geocritical vantage point has served as a fundamental tool in validation of this belief.

Beginning from pinning their geographical location in the Middle-earth and establishing that as a spatial projection of West of the primary world through multifocal perspectives of Hobbits and Elves, it has been attempt to bring to understanding the perceived places and conceived spaces behind the literary cartographies of Gondor and Rohan. Geographical and Urban descriptions that are both polysensory and a result of non-native (exogenous) observations, it has been established that the lands of Gondor and Rohan share strong similarities with the metropolitans of the Western Earth of past ages. Not only do the urbane localities resemble those of Western origin in the Primary world but the physical description of Men of Gondor and Rohan also reflects White races of Earth. Existence of these races as in colonial, post-colonial and neo-colonial as Self in the primary world, and them being the perceived place behind the conceived rendering of the race of Western Men in Middle-earth serves as a strong justification in them being the Self of the Secondary world or Middle-earth.

Apart from perceived and conceived spaces, Lefebvre’s third postulate of lived space from his book ‘*Production of Space*’ serves, in a secondary setting, as the character’s and hence reader’s place as well as space of any location in the secondary world. Lived space of Middle-earth for characters of Lord of the Rings is colonial in nature, diving the races into Self and Other with the very plot line acting as its chief proponent. The plot line makes an easy case of understanding races of Hobbits, Elves and Orcs as those of Othered races in the world. In addition to the central plot, treatment of Men with Other races also serves as a key justification of dubbing Men as the Self of their reality. Concepts of transgressivity and spacio-temporality have been explored in the Colonizer and Colonized beliefs of races and stratigraphic impacts being different for different peoples of the

world. Where Elves and Hobbits, remain eerily outside of space-time continuum, Men do not. Not only does this serve as justification for existence of Exotic Other but Orcs not being discussed at all in relation to anything also demarcates them the Demoniac half of the Othered races; leaving Men to be the invariable Self of their reality.

The Othered conception or othered spatialization of Elves, Hobbits and Orcs from the perceivable world or place may not have been an intentional act on the part of the author, nevertheless their delineation, the built of their societies and the dominating traits within each race, establishes them as the Exotic and Demonic Others of Middle-earth in the lived reality of the Secondary world. The mythical conception of Elves and Hobbits and a magical rendition of their lands in the cartography of Middle-earth, and simultaneously, a demonic conception of Orcs and a savage description of their lands in the topography of Middle-earth, lead to formation of a politically charged literary geography of the Secondary World for both the characters as well as the readers. Not only have exogenous perspectives been analyzed for the narration or description of each land to highlight the effects in their totality but the claims of the study have also been supported by intertextuality. As the world under consideration is a secondary world, therefore other texts of the author have been utilized apart from the Lord of the Rings trilogy for this purpose. Varying degrees of spacio-temporality in the spatialization of different regions and polysensoriality in the descriptions of those regions provide an essential tool for the validity of the conclusions made in this study. It can be stated from the above discussed justifications and traced traits in each race that while Elves and Hobbits are the Exotic Other, Orcs serve as the Demonic counterpart, while Men of the West remain a clear Self in the Secondary of Middle-earth.

Now that it is already established that racial identities reciprocate colonial ideology in Middle-earth, a discussion on their impact is imperative. Not only have races been divided into Self and

Other by tangible or visibly identifiable markers of geography, physical descriptions, topologies and cultural and societal setups or their treatment with each other, but the treatment of these races by author himself also serves as a key segregator. Othering by the plot line may pose a greater danger to the lived realities of the characters and hence resultantly to the perceived reality of the readers.

Lefebvre's cycle of perceived, conceived and lived spaces, resonates with the cyclical nature of Orientalism where a reader's image off of the writer's image of reality renders reality to be a product a cyclical process that eventually adds to the reality itself. Similarly, Tolkien's perception of othering and othered races in the primary world, serves as basis of the conception of races of Primary world, making their lived reality a Colonial reality. Resultantly, the readers perception of these races of Middle-earth ends in the fortified conception or spatiality of certain races as the othered in the primary world, bringing orientalist ideology from the secondary to the primary world itself. Secondary worlds, in this way, become a contemporary and active agent of Colonial thought in literature.

Colonialism and Othering in Fantasy is a situation more stark than in ordinary fiction because Fantasy itself serves as a critique of the primary world. Justification or promotion of Othering and Colonial thought in criticism or allegorical representation of primary world serves only to fortify these practices in the primary world by adding to perceived realities of the readers and hence the world itself. Othering within the world of Lord of the Rings requires attention because it is the pioneer of the entire concept of sub-created worlds, hence providing a pattern for its successors. And while colonialism may not be the key theme behind most Epic Fantasies, however, Othering in itself is the chief prevailing practice in one way or another. Analyses of Othering of Eastern races in particular requires more research and scholarship than is readily available. Tolkien's comparison of good and evil through the war between East and West is problematic if the popularity of the texts

incite further readership. It becomes imminent that more scholarly attention be sustained that may highlight Tolkien's and consequently other writers' approach towards the colonial ideology in the secondary worlds pervading the reality of our primary abode.

References

- Baker, D. F. (2016). What we found on our journey through fantasy land. *Child Lit Educ*, 37, 237-251. 10.1007/s10583-006-9009-1
- Bould, M., & Vint, S. (2012). Political readings. In E. James & F. Mendlesohn (Eds.), *The Cambridge companion to fantasy literature* (pp. 102-112). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Brown-Fuller, M. (2013). The uncanny and the postcolonial in J.R.R. Tolkien's Middle-Earth. [Unpublished Bachelor' dissertation] University of Central Florida.
- Childs, P., & Williams, P. (2013). *An introduction to post-colonial theory*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Crawford, K. (2002). *Turbulent times: Epic fantasy in adolescent literature* [Master's dissertation, Brigham University]. <https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd/84/>
- Drout, M. D. (Ed.). (2006). *JRR Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and critical assessment*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Fahlen, A. (2016). *Racial issues in Middle-Earth: A postcolonial perspective on J.R.R Tolkien's Lord of the Rings*. Unpublished manuscript, Karlstads Universitet, Karlstad, Sweden.
- Farrell, E. (2009). Race, language, and morality: Does Tolkien's middle-earth promote a racial myth? [Master's dissertation, Pittsburgh University]. <http://d-scholarship.pitt.edu/7806/>
- Fletcher, L. (Ed.). (2016). *Popular Fiction and Spatiality: Reading Genre Settings*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Fletcher, L. (2016). Introduction. In L. Fletcher (Ed.), *Fiction and Spatiality: Reading Genre Settings* (pp. 1-8). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gaiman, N. (2006) *Fragile Things: Short Fictions and Wonders*. New York, NY: HarperCollins
- Greene, D. (1996). Higher argument: Tolkien and the tradition of vision, epic and prophecy. *Mythlore*. Retrieved June 20, 2020, from <https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol21/iss2/10/>
- Hakkarainen, S. (2015). *The land of shadow, reading Mordor in J. R. R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings: A geopolitical Threat or the suppressed other?* [Master's dissertation, Tampere University]. <https://core.ac.uk/display/250136463?recSetID=>
- Hoiem, E. M. (2005). World creation as colonization: British imperialism in "Aldarion and Erendis". *Tolkien Studies*, 2, 75-92. 10.1353/tks.2005.0020
- Jackson, R. (2009). *Fantasy: The literature of subversion*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- James, E., & Mendlesohn, F. (Eds.). (2012). *The Cambridge companion to fantasy literature*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The Production of Space* (D. Nicholson-Smith, Trans.). Oxford, UK: Blackwell. (Original work published in 1974)
- Liebherr, L. (2012). *Reimagining Tolkien: A Post-colonial Perspective on The Lord of the Rings* [Unpublished Doctoral dissertation]. Limerick University.

Mitchell, P., & Stadler, J. (2011). Redrawing the Map. In R. T. Tally (Ed.), *Geocritical Explorations: Space, Place, and Mapping in Literary and Cultural Studies*(pp. 29-47). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Peißl, C. (2014). *The construction of evil in J. R. R. Tolkien's Middle-earth*. [Master's dissertation, Karl-Franzens University]. <http://unipub.uni-graz.at/urn:nbn:at:at-ubg:1-62797>

Rearick, A. (2004). Why is the only good Orc a dead Orc? The dark face of racism examined in Tolkien's world. *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50(4), 861-874. <https://doi.org/10.1353/mfs.2005.0008>

Rumsby, J. H. (2017). *Otherworldly others: Racial representation in fantasy literature* [Master's dissertation, Montreal University]. <https://core.ac.uk/reader/159485560>

Said, E. W. (1992). *The question of Palestine*. New York, NY: Vintage Books

Said, E. (2004). *Orientalism*, 1977. London, UK: Penguin

Said, E. W. (2012). *Culture and imperialism*. New York, NY: Vintage Book

Tally, R. T. (2010). Let us now praise famous Orcs: simple humanity in Tolkien's inhuman creatures. *Mythlore: A Journal of J.R.R. Tolkien, C.S. Lewis, Charles*

Williams, and Mythopoeic Literature. Retrieved June 20, 2020, from

<https://dc.swosu.edu/mythlore/vol29/iss1/3/>

Tally, R.T. (Ed.). (2011). *Geocritical Explorations: Space, Place, and Mapping in Literary and Cultural Studies*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Tally, R. T. (2013). *Spatiality*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Tally, R. T. (2015). *The Geocritical Legacies of Edward W. Said*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Tally, R. T. (2016). Tolkien's Geopolitical Fantasy: Spatial Narrative in *The Lord of the Rings*. In L. Fletcher (Ed.), *Fiction and Spatiality: Reading Genre Settings* (pp. 125-140). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan

Tolkien, J. R. R. (1991). *The Fellowship of the Ring: Being the first part of The Lord of the Rings*. London, UK: Grafton.

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2000). *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*. H. Carpenter & C. Tolkien (Eds.). Boston, US: Houghton Mifflin.

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2001). *The Two Towers: Being the second part of The Lord of the Rings* (film tie-in ed.). London, UK: Grafton.

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2006) *The Monsters and the Critics And Other Essays*, ed. Tolkien, C., London: Harper Collins

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2007). *The Return of the King: Being the third part of The Lord of the Rings*. London, UK: Harper Collins Publishers.

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2009). *The Hobbit*. London, UK: Harper Collins E-books. Retrieved from <https://www.harpercollins.co.uk/9780007322602/the-hobbit/>

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2013). *The Silmarillion* (C. Tolkien, Ed.). London, UK: Harper Collins Publishers.

Van Vuuren, G. L. J. (2014). *Negotiating a new cultural space: aspects of fantasy in contemporary South African youth literature*. [Master's dissertation, Pretoria University]. <https://repository.up.ac.za/handle/2263/50628>

Ward, A. (2011). *Realising the Dream: The story of Epic Fantasy* [Doctoral dissertation, Flinders University]. <https://flex.flinders.edu.au/file/fbc25d30-7244->

[4f99-8a99-1e22051a1ab0/1/Thesis-Ward-2011.pdf](#)

Werber, N. (2005). Geo- and biopolitics of Middle-earth: A German reading of Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*. *New Literary History*, 36(2), 227-246. <https://doi.org/10.1353/nlh.2005.0039>

Westphal, B. (2011a). Foreword. In R. T. Tally (Ed.), *Geocritical Explorations: Space, Place, and Mapping in Literary and Cultural Studies*(pp. ix-xv). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Westphal, B. (2011b). *Geocriticism: Real and Fictional Space* (R.T. Tally, Trans.). New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan. (original work published in 2007)

.Young, H. (2016). *Race and popular fantasy literature: Habits of whiteness*. New York, NY: Routledge.



RESEARCH
PARKS